# CITY OF MUSKEGON HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

# April 1, 2003

The meeting was called to order at 4:00 p.m. by Chairperson, D. Chambers.

MEMBERS PRESENT: D. Chambers, J. Hilt, L. Spataro, L. Cole, A. Medema,

T. Bosma, T. Russo

MEMBERS ABSENT:

STAFF PRESENT: B. Moore, B. Lazor, H.Griffith

OTHERS PRESENT: M. Ortiz, 1077 Pine; R. Robotham, Bethany Housing

Ministries; D. Johnson, 441 W Muskegon; W. Wright, 452

W Webster.

# APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A motion to approve the regular meeting minutes of March 4, 2003 was made by J. Hilt, supported by A. Medema and unanimously approved.

# WALK-ON

A motion to accept cases 2003-14, 2003-15, 2003-16, and 2003-17 as walk-ons, was made by L. Spataro, supported by A. Medema and unanimously approved.

#### NEW BUSINESS/PUBLIC HEARINGS

Case 2003-13: Request to Renovate the Home. Applicant: Millie Ortiz, 362 W. Muskegon (1077 Pine); District: Houston; Class: A. B. Lazor presented the staff report. Applicant wishes to renovate this house once it is moved to Muskegon Avenue. At its current location (1077 Pine Street) the house lacks a clear-cut architectural definition. It is based in the Victorian Era with several Queen Anne characteristics. The porch has already been torn down, and the wide red siding has been removed in preparation for the move. After the house is situated on the new lot at 362 West Muskegon Avenue, the applicant will begin the transformation. A new wrap-around porch with columns and railings will be constructed as indicated in the drawings. The original siding will be restored in most parts of the house, except where indicated on the supplied drawings, shingles will be used as accents. Brackets will be added under the eaves. Currently, the kitchen located in the rear of the house is small; therefore the applicant wishes to construct a 16' X 27' addition as indicated in the supplied drawings. The applicant has also supplied pictures from architectural books that show the different elements of the Queen Anne Style that she wishes to incorporate. The first thing to consider in this project is that the building is not currently located in an historic district. Therefore, a dramatic transformation to a distinct architectural style may be appropriate. Generally the house can be classified as a Victorian Era

HDC Minutes 4/01/03

home with some Queen Anne features (including a cantilevered upper story, a bay window, brackets, and leaded glass windows) What the applicant is trying to accomplish is to make the house a more distinct style. Queen Anne architecture includes accent shingles, wrap-around porches, and other features like the applicant has included with the submitted materials. Because the city is a mix of residential architectural styles, this house would be a fine addition to the Muskegon Avenue corridor. Staff recommends approval of the renovation of this house per submitted details. Applicant is reminded to obtain all necessary building permits and to meet all necessary zoning guidelines.

M. Ortiz provided the commission members with large architect designs of the proposed changes to the home. She added that the shingle locations would be different because the siding was in good shape underneath.

A motion that construction of the porch, columns, railings, accent shingles, eave brackets, 16' X 27' addition and the move to a more defined Queen Anne architectural style be approved per submitted details with the following condition: 1. Any other exterior work not described in this application shall come back before the HDC unless it can be handled under the staff approval policy, was made by L. Cole, supported by L. Spataro and unanimously approved.

#### Walk On

Case 2003-14: Request to re-side house and install windows. Applicant: Bethany Housing Ministries; 1440 Clinton; District: Clinton-Peck; Class: A. B. Lazor gave the staff report. The applicant would like to install "Triple 3 Style" vinyl siding and will wrap the trim. The commission members were provided with examples of what the applicant would like to use. The applicant would also install aluminum fascia and soffits and vinyl replacement windows. There would be no change in size except in the rear of the house where the two double-hung windows would be changed into a slider to accommodate the kitchen countertop.

R. Robotham stated that he is working with Wil from Community Neighborhood Services Office. He will be using CDBG funding for this project. T. Bosma asked if any exterior work was planned. R. Robotham stated that there would be some minor work done. T. Bosma asked if there would be railings for the deck and steps installed. R. Robotham stated that the deck is low enough that railings are not needed. There are 2 sets of steps to the deck. One of them would be removed since they are rickety. He added that the diamond leaded glass would remain.

A motion that the installation of Triple 3 style vinyl siding with wrap trim, aluminum fascia and soffits, and the installation of vinyl replacement windows with the change to the rear window from 2 double-hung to 1 slider window be approved, was made by T. Bosma, supported by J. Hilt and unanimously approved.

Case 2003-15: Request to re-side house and install windows. Applicant: Deloris Arnold-Johnson; 441 W. Muskegon; District: Houston; Class: A. B. Lazor presented the staff report. The applicant would like to replace the windows on the front porch with vinyl double hung windows with grills and replace the front door. She would also like to replace the side door entrance roof with a new rood that is attached to the existing peak. Pictures were provided to the commission members. She would also like to replace the vinyl siding on the house. The house currently has vinyl siding and she would like to use 4" Dutch lap vinyl. Samples of the existing siding and proposed siding were shown to the commission members.

HDC Minutes 4/01/03 2

J. Hilt asked if the proposed windows on the front porch would look the same as what is currently there. D. Johnson stated that they would. L. Spataro asked if the window opening would be the same size. D. Johnson stated that it would. A. Medema asked if the shutters were staying the same. D. Johnson stated that they would. L. Spataro asked if the new door was going to be the first door that would be entered or would it be inside the porch entering into the home. D. Johnson stated that it would be the first door entered.

A motion that all the windows in the home be replaced with vinyl double hung widows with grills, the front door be replaced, and the vinyl siding be replaced with 4" Dutch lap vinyl, was made by L. Spataro, supported by T. Bosma and unanimously approved.

Case 2003-16: Request to Install Fencing. Applicant: FenceMan of Muskegon; 1587 Peck St.; District: Clinton-Peck; Class: A. B. Lazor presented the staff report. The applicant would like to install 6' high by 64' long dog-ear wood fencing on the property line from the front of the garage to the rear property line. Along with 4' high-galvanized chain and posts looped fence from post to post 10' apart from the front of the garage to 18" from the sidewalk. Zoning has no problems with this request.

D. Chambers asked about the use of the galvanized loop chain fence. B. Lazor stated that he wasn't sure if it was at the contractor's suggestion or if it was what the property owner had wanted. The commission members have the option to approve part of the request. T. Bosma stated that he was uncomfortable with the proposed fencing that would be located beyond the front of the home. L. Spataro agreed. He stated that it looked like the distance between the driveways was about 3 ft. He wasn't sure that the fence would be compatible. He suggested that they table the street view portion of the fence and approve what would be in the back.

A motion that the 6' by 64' dog-ear wood fencing on the property line from the garage to the rear property line be approved, was made by A. Medema, supported by L. Spataro and unanimously approved.

A motion that the 4' galvanized chain and posts looped fence from post to post 10' apart from the front of the garage to 18" from the sidewalk be tabled, was made by L. Spataro, supported by A. Medema and unanimously approved.

Case 2003-17: Request to Change Edge of Porch Decking. Applicant: William Wright; 452 W Webster Ave.; District: National Register; Class: AA. B. Lazor presented the staff report. The applicant would like to change the edge of the deck. A drawing was provided to the commission members.

D. Chambers asked if the change was for looks. W. Wright stated that the existing decking doesn't look like it belongs. The proposed change would look better.

A motion that the change to the edge of the porch decking be approved, was made by T. Russo, supported by J. Hilt and unanimously approved.

# **OLD BUSINESS**

None.

HDC Minutes 4/01/03

#### **OTHER BUSINESS**

New Historic District Designations – D. Chambers asked how many buildings were being looked at. L. Spataro stated that there were 5. They were the Hackley Bank, National City Bank, Savings & Loan, Century Club, and Daniel's building. The Hackley Bank building seemed to be the only controversial one. The proposal is for a mixed use with residential on Morris and Clay. L. Cole asked if there were any drawings available for this. L. Spataro stated that he didn't know of any. D. Chambers asked if there should be a site designation or a continuation of the Clay-Western District. B. Moore stated that a district is made up of continuous parcels. Each site should be designated so it won't hinder the development. She stated that the developer would have to apply for a PUD for the proposed mixed use. There would be Planning Commission approval and the City Commission approval for it.

A motion to recommend that the City Commission create an ad-hoc committee for the research of new historic district designations, was made by L. Spataro, supported by T. Bosma and unanimously approved.

<u>Coastline Deli</u> – B. Lazor stated that he had a request to be able to use umbrellas for the outside seating from the Coastline Deli. He was informed that they could get some free umbrellas from Coke, but they would have coke symbols on them. This would fall under the sign ordinance. If the commission members would prefer them to buy some umbrellas that have no advertising, they would be willing to do this if required. The commission members concurred that there would be no problem with umbrellas from Coke as they would only be out during warmer weather.

The meeting adjourned at 4:51 p.m.

hmg 04/01/03

HDC Minutes 4/01/03 4

<sup>&</sup>quot;We admire that which is old not because it is old, but because it is beautiful."

Winston Churchill